

Music as *Simulacrum* of Mental Life

Stuart Feder, M.D.

Pre-Circulated Discussion Paper., presented on Saturday, January 24, 2004
Winter Meetings of the American Psychoanalytic Association, Waldorf-Astoria Hotel, New York

The same zeitgeist that animated Sigmund Freud's concept of "free association" and William James's "stream of consciousness" engendered comparable innovations in the arts, most prominently in literature (James Joyce's *Ulysses*) and painting (e.g. the surrealists). The present work-in-progress addresses itself to the ways in which music-par excellence the art of process and time-may mirror ordinary ongoing mental life.

While earlier musical examples are considered, after the turn-of-century 1900 and into the postmodern period, a degree of sophistication led to works in which, superimposed upon traditional formal procedures (sonata, variation, fugue etc) composers have created a rich sonic semblance of inner life. This simulacrum entails mental processes such as memory, and its vicissitudes in intrusion, distortion, and denial; and mental functions such as the pace of mental life, the discharge of tension and the generation and encoding of affects.

While the composer's craft necessarily entails idiosyncratic character and style, the ultimate appreciation of this semblance, hence its significance, depends upon its individual final pathway in the "ear" of the receptive listener.

Musical examples (on recording) are selected from the works of Schubert, Schumann, Gustav Mahler, Arnold Schoenberg, Charles Ives and Luciano Berio.

Around the turn of the century, the same Zeitgeist that animated Sigmund Freud's concept of "free association" and William James's "stream of consciousness" engendered innovations in the arts. Perhaps the best known example is in literature where in James Joyce's *Ulysses*, as Richard Ellman observed, "thoughts are disclosed in internal monologues that register the slightest waverings of consciousness or of the world that surrounds consciousness." The surrealist movement in art in France in the early twentieth century, which rapidly spread elsewhere, was only one of several influenced by Freud; this was particularly true as *The Interpretation of Dreams* and other writings became available in translation. If one of the aims of free association was the relinquishing of conscious control of mental activity, the surrealists "took from Freud confirmation of the existence of a deep reservoir of unknown and scarcely

tapped energies within the psyche.”² As Jennifer Mundy writes, "Their use of techniques to reduce the element of conscious control in their drawings and writings, and their patient recording of dream imagery were more and more seen by theorists of the movement as attempts to express the inner world of undirected and uncensored thought that Freud had described.”³

Little of a critical nature has been written on the influence of this cultural trend in music, while inevitably it has exerted a creative influence. It is the purpose of this essay to explore the ramifications of the "free association/stream of consciousness" influence in music. While in parallel to literature and art after the turn of the century, most examples will be selected from twentieth century composers, semblances of mental life can be observed in earlier music as well. How earlier examples differ from those influenced by the modernist trend will be something to consider later. With regard to the underlying philosophy of music, if one considers the proverbial relationship between music and human emotions, then writings on the aesthetics of music have always been grappling with the manner in which music reflects inner life.

The discussion that follows is in six sections:

1. What and how music means: Hanslick, Langer and the aesthetics of music.
2. The "free association/stream of consciousness" trend: Freud and William James.
3. Music and memory: the case of Schubert.
4. The mental life *similacrum* in music: Schoenberg, Mahler, Ives.
5. A postmodern *similacrum*: Luciano Berio's *Sinfonia*
6. Mind to mind: from the composer to the listener.

(1) What and How Music Means: Hanslick, Langer and the Aesthetics of Music

"The term 'aesthetics of music'", according to the Groves Dictionary of Music (the major reference in the English language) "normally designates attempts to explain what music means." It cites among other things: "the difference between what is and what is not music; the place of

music in human life and its relevance to and understanding of human nature and history ... and the place of music in the system of reality." Among its chief considerations is "how music conveys what." Groves notes that in practice "musical aesthetics has been dominated by a single theme: the nature and import of that powerful yet indeterminate emotional impact that music has or is thought to have."⁵

More specifically, the issue of representability has been a perennial topic of debate, the most influential critic in the nineteenth century having been Eduard Hanslick (1885-1904) who asserted famously, that music "means" nothing other than itself its content consists of tonally moving forms. "The essence of music, " he wrote "is sound and motion."⁶

Arguably, Hanslick's most prominent adversary was the philosopher Susanne K. Langer (1895-1986) a century later.

The tonal structures we call 'music' bear a close logical similarity to the forms of human feeling-forms of growth and attenuation, flowing and stowing, conflict and resolution, speed, arrest, terrific excitement, calm or subtle activation, and dreamy lapses-not joy or sorrow perhaps, but the poignancy of either or both the greatness and brevity and eternal passing of everything vitally felt. Such is the pattern, or logical form of sentience; and the pattern of music is that same form worked out in pure, measured sound and silence.⁷

Thus Langer's answer to Hanslick's decree that music is the "sound and motion" of tonally moving forms, is that music is the "tonal analogue of emotive life."

(2) The "free association/stream of consciousness" Trend; Freud (1856-1939 and William James (1842-1910)

The turn of the century saw a revolution in thinking that affected the manner in which emotional life, or mental life (a preferable term because it encompasses not only affects but other

content as well, such as fantasy) was viewed; and, accordingly, the ramifications of mental life in art. A marker for this development in western thought is Freud's *Interpretation of Dreams* which he dated 1900, looking forward to the new century. Reminiscing on his discovery of a new method of interpretation in his *Autobiographical Study*, Freud wrote:

Instead of urging the patient to say something upon some particular subject, I now ask him to abandon himself to a process of free association -that is, to say whatever comes into his head, while ceasing to give any conscious direction to his thoughts. It was essential, however that he should bind himself to report literally everything that occurred to his self-perception and not give way to critical objections which sought to put certain associations on one side on the ground that they were not sufficiently important or that they were irrelevant or that they were altogether meaningless.⁸

At virtually the same time William James was writing about "The Stream of Thought," perhaps his most important single contribution.⁹ "We now begin our study of the mind from within," he writes. The bedrock is: "The first fact for us, then, as psychologists, is that thinking of some sort goes on." Answering his own question as to "[h]ow does it go on?", James cites what he takes to be the characteristics of thought. Among them are: "thought tends to be part of a personal consciousness;" it is "always changing" and "sensibly continuous; it deals with objects independent of itself"; but "chooses from among them" welcoming or rejecting ... interested in some parts of these objects to the exclusion of others."¹⁰

The first of these, namely that "thought tends to personal form," which may seem apparently obvious, was revolutionary in its specificity: "The only states of consciousness that we naturally deal with are found in personal consciousness, minds, selves, concrete particular I's and you's."¹¹ Human thought is "cognitive" in that it "appears to deal with objects independent of itself" We all believe, he clarifies, in a reality outside of thought; "an extra-mental duplicate". "The objects of our thoughts, " he writes, " have a duplicate existence outside."¹²

As for continuity, James writes, "[c]onsciousness does not appear to itself chopped up in bits", nor is it "jointed". Rather, "it flows. A 'river' or 'stream' is the metaphor by which it is most naturally described." James adds (in italics) the term for which he became famous: "In talking of it hereafter, let us call it the stream of thought, of consciousness, or subjective life."¹³

The revolution in "thinking about thinking" as pioneered by James and Freud would become a hallmark of modernity in art. Perhaps the most celebrated document of this trend in literature is James Joyce's (1882-1941) *Ulysses* published in 1923. Leopold Bloom's internal monologues as crafted by Joyce (cited by Ellman at the beginning of this paper) "register the slightest waverings of consciousness or of the world that surrounds consciousness."¹⁴

It is important for our purposes here to note that Joyce was painstakingly selecting and arranging when he appeared to be merely mirroring the random workings of Bloom's mind. Uncannily, as artist, he was recapitulating what William James called the mind's activity in dealing with "objects independent of itself... choosing among them ... welcoming or rejecting." This after all, is the artist's craft.

Nor was Joyce's work merely the random reflection of his own mind put to paper: In Susanne Langer's terms, it was not "the *symptomatic* expression" of thoughts and feelings that beset the artist, but a *symbolic* expression of the forms of sentience as he understands them." [italics mine]¹⁵ With regard to the craft involved, Lean Edel wrote: "[Joyce's] selection was addressed to the creating of an illusion *that there had been no illusion*."¹⁶ Thus James exercised close control when he seemed to dredge up a great deal of manifestly unrelated material.

Meanwhile, the modern confessional novel had taken root in the writings of Dostoevsky which, not surprisingly, intrigued Freud. It is no coincidence that a frequent stylistic feature in Dostoevsky is the "confessor's" addressing some party in the guise of the reader, to explain

himself as it were. Similarly, free association in the clinical setting typically involves some awareness of the listening analyst thus forming a part of the transference. The difference in mere mentation-the private awareness of the free associative flow or "stream of consciousness" or self-confessions- and its representation in art or enactment clinically, lies in the presence of a witness who may be actual or virtual.

(3) Music and Memory: the Case of Schubert

Freud's discovery of the unconscious, and the consequent technique of free association to access its content, was innovative; the success of psychoanalysis owing to a variety of factors, among them the comprehensive theoretical context that was *in statu nascendi* and the appropriateness of a particular patient population who could benefit. But precursors were many.¹⁷

Similarly, prior to the twentieth century in music a trend could be traced toward the tonal representation of certain universal aspects of mental life. This should not be surprising from several points of view. Music exists in time and in fact, creates its own time. In this "narrative" sense there is both an *agency* that creates and an *auditor* who experiences, against a background of temporality. Both inhere in the music and may be virtual; that is, the agent is not necessarily the composer, nor is physical sound required. The temporal "canvas" invites an analogy with ongoing mental life. In music at least two trends can be discerned: the fascination with fantasy and the importance of memory.

Fantasy, throughout various periods in musical history has always been poised against the prevalent rules of strict form. Within this dialectic there resulted a degree of freedom analogous to the freedom, not only of "free association", but of normal fantasy formation. Composers of

genius throughout the ages who "freed" themselves from the constraints of acceptable forms created unique forms of their own, while certain rhetorical features were observed; namely musical gestures of beginning/middle/end and repetition of musical ideas.

The repetition of musical ideas is a basic feature of Western music. Indeed repetition characterized traditional formal structures as they evolved such as the *aria da capo*¹⁸ of the eighteenth century and the *sonata form*.¹⁹ It was thus that a fundamental feature of ongoing mental life became ensconced in music, namely memory. Forms such as these engaged the mental life of the auditor even as it mirrored it.

In the Renaissance the term *Fantasia* (and its varied translations as *Fantasia*, *Phantasia*, *Phantasia*, in German; *Fancie* and *Fancy*, in English etc.) referred to an instrumental work "whose form and invention" was cogently described by a contemporary writer in 1535-36 as stemming "solely from the fantasy and skill of the author who created it." Subsequently up until the 19th century, the fantasia tended to retain this subjective license, and its formal and stylistic characteristics may consequently vary widely. . ."²⁰ The term persisted to the present day carrying along with it a multitude of composers throughout Europe, among whom were Johann and C.P.E. Sebastian Bach (*Chromatic Fantasy and Fugue*), Beethoven (*Fantasia for piano, op. 77* and *Choral Fantasy, op. 80*), and the nineteenth century romantics.

It was among the latter, chiefly Franz Schubert (1797-1828), Robert Schumann (1810-1856), and Johannes Brahms (1833-1897), that the musical fantasy reached its apogee and refinement. For them "the fantasia. . . provided the means for an expansion of forms, both thematically and emotionally. The *sonata* itself had crystallized into a more or less rigid formal scheme, and the fantasia offered far greater freedom in the use of thematic material and virtuoso writing."²¹ These three composers (among others) were caught up in the same developing

zeitgeist that generated the concepts of Freud and William James; led eventually to literary works such as *Ulysses* and the confessional novel; and eventually to the music of the twentieth century composers we will consider later. Repeatedly, in their music, there is a representation of mind that goes beyond formal freedom and the traditional, rhetorical use of memory as an organizing principle. Rather, one finds additionally, a musical *semblance* of the covert operational flow of mental life-the spontaneous "doings" of the mind.

Only in recent years have musical scholars become intrigued with this representation of mind in music. The music, of course had been a focus of study for at least 150 years, most prominently in the second half of the nineteenth century. What has changed is an incipient emancipation of musicologists from a "deterministic" late nineteenth and early twentieth century heritage, and consequent openness to interdisciplinary studies. Their work has been enriched by their readings in disciplines such as cognitive science. Less acknowledged is any debt to psychoanalysis which has advanced its way in mainstream popular culture where, while lower in academic prestige, its terminology had become the coin of the realm. The issues involved-the flow of mental life; its hiatuses and fragmentations; the function of fantasy; the nature of memory and its vicissitudes; all, have been topics of psychoanalysis from its onset.

Indicative of this scholarly trend is a recent issue of The Musical Quarterly in a six part section "Memory and Schubert's Instrumental Music."²² In an introduction, Walter Frisch writes:

From Robert Schumann on, commentators have resorted to metaphors of memory to capture in prose the special quality of Schubert's instrumental works. *Recollection, retrospection, association, nostalgia*: these are some of the concepts that float through Schubert criticism and that the writers in the present issue seek, if not to systematize, then at least to explore and develop in a more comprehensive fashion.²³ [Italics mine]

These first three of these "concepts," of course, are historically fundamental to psychoanalysis and the fourth, "nostalgia" a special instance.²⁴ In this ground-breaking symposium each of the subsequent articles deal with specific and major instrumental works of Schubert.

Significantly, music with texts which might suggest verbal representation are omitted in these studies. Nevertheless, it is noteworthy that several major song cycles employ substantial recollection as closing musical gestures, among them Beethoven's *An die ferne Geliebte* (1815-16) and Schumann's *Faunenliebe und Leben* (1840), the latter an entirely instrumental retrospection to the piano introduction.

Particularly noteworthy in the "Memory and Schubert" symposium is Scott Burnham's, "*Schubert and the Sound of Memory*." Burnham observes:

We are *how* we remember. The act of recollection is a fundamentally creative act as well as an existential act; it is at once self-expression and self-constitution. The more overtly self-expressive acts that we call art mirror this aspect of recollection ... It is thus no coincidence that we often treat artworks as if they exude consciousness.²⁵

Burnham sums up: "Music, we like to say, is about time. Whereas a Beethoven can seem to enlist time in a glorious ride to the future, Schubert makes us feel its irrevocable passing. We hear the sound of memory."²⁶

[MUSICAL EXAMPLE 1: Schubert, *Piano Sonata in A Major; Finale*, ending]

Here the fragmentation of the main themes of the movement interspersed with silence creates the illusion of reminiscence-literally, "the sounds of memory."

[MUSICAL EXAMPLE 2: Schubert, *Impromptu No. 1 in C minor*, D. 899, beginning]

The initial single note focuses attention. What follows is the beginning of a melody, unaccompanied. An illusion of remembering is created of a tune coming to mind the second part of which (consequent phrase) is harmonized. As if, "what was that tune?"

(4) The Mental Life Simulacrum in Music: Schoenberg, Mahler Ives

In contrast to the representation of pastness that characterizes the music of Schubert, one finds a more comprehensive representation of mental life among composers of the latter part of the nineteenth century and the twentieth. Here may be found music true to the life-of-mind of William James's "stream of consciousness" where content is "personal", "continuous" and "always changing"; in which there is a selection of content. James's "duplicate existence" outside the mind in reality finds an alternative duplicate in a created semblance of mind. Like the content of Freud's free association, this semblance ideally creates an illusion that there is no conscious direction to thought; rather that "everything that occurred to ... self-perception" has been recorded." Like the literary constructions of James Joyce, or the "confessional" structures of Dostotevsky, these are not merely emotive or "symptomatic" in Langer's sense but rather "a symbolic expression." And whereas in Langer's view, music is the "tonal analogue of *emotive* life," here we are dealing with an analogue of the totality of mental life; an artistically structured illusion in music.

If successful (as Leon Edel has said about James Joyce's constructions) an illusion is created "that there had been no illusion." I suggest the term for this is *simulacrum*, according to

the OED, "[s]omething having merely the form or appearance of a certain thing, without possessing its substance or proper qualities."²⁷ Thus, in the present case, a semblance or illusion of thought processes. More functionally, the Concise Oxford Dictionary defines *simulacrum* as simply, "an image of something."²⁸ Everyday *simulacra* include photographs although thoughtful analysis reveals that such semblances are far from simple.²⁹ The creation of mental-life *simulacra* in music to which we will come presently, is no isolated phenomenon in either art or technology. The invention of human-like representations and automata have a long history and include such phenomena as Madame Tussard's waxworks and Thomas Edison's talking dolls.³⁰ Most recently, the idea of the simulacrum and its role as icon in society has been developed by Jean Baudrillard.³¹

In the field of music around the turn of the century, not only did composition reflect the "free association/stream of thought" trend, but the way in which an audience *heard* music was influenced by the mental life model in art. Arnold Schoenberg (1874-1951) was a particularly acute observer, and as articulate in prose as he was in music. He writes of the ideal *listener* of his youth, that is, the era of Brahms.

It was customary that a musician, when he heard a composition for the first time, observed its construction, was able to follow the elaboration and derivation of its themes and its modulations, and could recognize the number of voices in canon and the presence of the theme in a variation; and there were laymen who after one hearing could take a melody home in their memory. But I am sure there was not much talk about style.³²

Schoenberg's argument regards the nature of style in music: "Every man has fingerprints of his own, and every craftsman's hand has its personality; out of such subjectivity grow the traits which comprise the style of the finished product.... Style is the quality of a work and is based on natural conditions, expressing him who produced it."³³

New music required new ways of listening as "free association" and "stream of consciousness" entered the domain of music. While nowhere in Schoenberg's published prose writings does he mention Freud or psychoanalysis, Theodor Adorno elaborates the very point Schoenberg made on the individuality of style, connecting him to the mainstream of psychoanalytic thought: "Works of Schoenberg's middle period [for example, *Erwartung* or *The Little Piano Piece*] place his work in direct relationship to psychoanalysis." There is a "psychic drive," Adorno elaborates, "toward undisguised and uninhibited expression of the psyche and of the unconscious per se."³⁴

The same may be said about the style of other modernist composers-although certainly not all. Examples in this paper will be drawn from the music of Arnold Schoenberg and Gustav Mahler in Europe; and Charles Ives in America. (I would add parenthetically that it is exactly the simulacrum of mental life in the music of Ives and Mahler that drew me to the study of these composers .³⁵)

Schoenberg's *Ewartung* of 1909 (Opus 17), called a "monodrama" for orchestra and voice -- essentially a short opera for solo dramatic soprano -- is based on a poem by Marie Pappenheim. The task the composer set himself relates not only to creating the illusion of the flow of mental life, but to the time frame of the experience. In the composer's words:

In *Ewartung* the aim is to represent in *slow motion* everything that occurs during a single second of maximum spiritual excitement, stretching it out to half an hour.³⁶

Here the composer acknowledges that complex mental events may be experienced in seconds; as any analyst knows while scrambling to verbalize elusive thoughts to the listening

analyst. Adorno characterized Schoenberg's feat as "the eternity of the second in four hundred bars."³⁷ What Schoenberg does in *Ewartung* is to "explode" the moment in order for the audience to fully grasp it. The immediacy of the music is reflected in the speed with which Schoenberg wrote the work: fourteen days! The ideal audience for such works of music is not that of Brahms' era that Schoenberg described, the audience that could follow the sonata form's statement of themes, key changes, development etc. Rather, the essential listening equipment required here is an introspective awareness of one's own mental life, and the capacity to appreciate that of another. Significantly, during this period of Schoenberg's compositions he had all but abandoned the musical structures inherent in tonality, and here depended not only upon the text, but the illusion of mind as an organizing principle.

In the first of the four scenes of *Ewartung*, an unnamed woman, referred to as Die Frau, is desperately wandering through the forest at night searching for her lover. In the final scene she discovers his corpse. Distraught to near-psychotic proportions, with her necrophiliac kiss, she wonders in paranoid fashion if he has been unfaithful. The piece ends with the dawn and her longing and grief.

Adorno likened the text to a psychoanalytic case study.³⁸ Indeed some have seen a connection with the case of Anna O. and even Dora.³⁹ The stream-of-consciousness libretto -- a fragmentary and elusive text -- was written by Marie Pappenheim, a young medical student who wrote poetry. She was related to Bertha Pappenheim, the original Anna O. of the 1895 *Studies in Hysteria*.⁴⁰ The music has been rightly described as "lush, strident, soothing, sinister and sometimes downright frightening."⁴¹ The uncertainty of key mirrors the woman's mental state as her rapidly shifting inner and outer perceptions creates the illusion of her mental life.

[MUSICAL EXAMPLE 3: *Erwartung*, Scene I, Track 1⁴²] "The edge of the forest. . . lit by the moon ... A woman approaches ... clothed in white ... Go in there! ... I can't see the path ... How silvery the tree trunks gleam ... like birches! Oh, our garden ... The flowers meant for him are sure to have withered. . ."]

[MUSICAL EXAMPLE 4: *Erwartung*, from Scene IV, Track, 5] "A broad, moonlit road" disappearing into darkness and ending in a darkly shuttered house. "The woman enters slowly, exhausted ... Her dress is torn ... her face and hands are bleeding." Shortly, she encounters the corpse of her lover.

"The moonlight ... no, there ... That terrible head ... that spectre ... If only it would disappear ... like the one in the forest ... The shadow of a tree, an absurd branch ... The moon is deceitful ... because it is bloodless it paints red blood. . ."]

Adorno also wrote trenchantly on the music of Gustav Mahler. Among the stylistic features of Mahler's music, one stands out as a universal simulacrum of mental life; what he calls a "breakthrough" or *Durchbruch*.⁴³ Mahler's "breakthroughs" mirror ordinary mental activity in that they might be quite brief, as if a thought or memory spontaneously coming to mind; or extended, as if falling into a reverie or state of reminiscence. An example of the first -- a familiar one -- can be heard in the fourth movement or *Funeral March* of Mahler's *First Symphony*. It occurs in the context of the dirge on the minor key version of the round, *Bruder Martin*, or more familiarly, *Frere Jacques*. Mahler described the music to his friend and chronicler Natalie Bauer-Lechner:

On the surface one might imagine this scenario: A funeral procession passes by our hero, and the misery, the whole distress of the world, with its cutting contrasts and horrible irony grasps him. The funeral march of "Brother Martin" one has to imagine as being played in a dull manner by a band of very bad musicians, as they usually follow such funeral processions. The roughness, gaiety, and banality of this world then appears in the sounds of some interfering Bohemian musicians, heard at the same time as the terribly painful lamentations of the hero, It has shocking effect in its sharp irony and inconsiderate polyphony. . .⁴⁴

One may hear this intrusion of the "interfering Bohemian musicians" as an auditory memory suddenly flashing to mind, a memory from the childhood of the composer in the form of a *similacrum* of mental life.

[MUSICAL EXAMPLE 5: Gustav Mahler, *Symphony No. 1, Todtenmarsch*]

A more extended example can be heard in the *Third Symphony*, in the two interludes of the *Scherzo*, known as the "Posthorn Solo." There, in the midst of a lively and satirical *Scherzo* (based on a song about the death of the nightingale, with its bird-call motifs) the music gradually slows and becomes reflective. A new state of mind is induced as one hears the sound of the posthorn from afar. Rendered in modern performance by trumpet solo, the posthorn was in fact the instrument carried by the driver of the post-stage. In the Bohemia of Mahler's childhood the stagecoach would stop at the milestone of a village, which would actually have a representation of a posthorn incised in the granite, and blow a signal for the community to gather in the square to receive the mail.

The episode is rich in associations. A literary association refers to a well-known poem by Nikolaus Lenau, *Der Postillon*, a eulogy for the dead stagecoach driver whose spectral tune can be heard at the milestone of the village. A personal association was related by Mahler, a nostalgic reference to childhood visits to a cousin in the Czech countryside, where homesick, he recalled hearing the arrival of the postcoach. In the re-creation of memory, Mahler evokes not only time but space as well; his directions on the score read: "Post horn *wie aus weiter Ferne*," [as from far away.] (In addition there is a layering of musical associations within the tune itself, ranging from a Liszt piano concerto to Johann Strauss' *Blue Danube Waltz*!)

[MUSICAL EXAMPLE 6: Gustav Mahler, *Symphony No. 3, Scherzo-Pasthorn Solo*]

The American composer Charles Ives had a unique sense of personal identity. It informed a quality of mind in which the persons, places and things that define an individual were always in the forefront. The persons most prominent were his village-bandmaster father, at whose knee he learned music; his wife who warmly encouraged his music; and all-American figures of history and culture such as Henry David Thoreau and Abraham Lincoln. The places were the small-town America where he grew up; to a lesser degree New York City where he worked; but most importantly, sites that were sacred to him such as Main Street Danbury, Walden Pond, Boston Common and the Housatonic River at Stockbridge, Massachusetts. The things were the artifacts of everyday life, large and small. Prominent among them were not only physical objects in the usual sense (such as his Danbury hat and baseball glove) but the endless tunes that he had learned in childhood. In fact these latter -- quoted frankly in his music, embedded there in derivative form or alluded to in paraphrase -- became important determinants of style in his music. That said, another characteristic of Ives the person and his music was an extraordinary access to childhood and childhood memory. These facets of mental life were ensconced in his music.

We will consider a single example in a short song of Charles Ives, *Old Home Day*, for which he wrote words and music. The song begins with something literally memorized while Ives was a student at Yale: a quote from Virgil that whose music is an invitation to the reminiscent state of mind. (in Latin, "Go my songs. . .") There follow a series of memories -- of a tune recalled from his boyhood Opera House (there really was one); of crossing the "square there" (it rhymes); of the boys shouting patriotic songs (hear a parody of "John Brown's body ..." in the melody underneath); to an allusion to the "brave and fair" patriots themselves. Then,

suddenly, a scene: it is the "Village Band" marching "down Main Street" Danbury, the band that Ives's father led in parade there. Recalled are the trees lining the street (they were still Elms); an Irish tune (heard in the background-the result of the influx of the Irish to Danbury); and a memory of "the old church bell." This ushers in a waft of nostalgia: "Underneath's a note of sadness", to the tune of the sentimental ballad, *Annie Lisle* (also later known as Cornell's *Alma Mater*.)

[MUSICAL EXAMPLE 7: Old Home Day, William Sharp, baritone; Stephen Blier, piano⁴⁵]

Comparable to a James Joyce soliloquy, Ives has created a semblance of mental life in text and music. Like the examples from the works of Schoenberg and Mahler, there is "an illusion that there had been no illusion." Whatever other organizing principles may be operant, these composers have created a simulacrum of mental life in music.

(5) A Postmodern Simulacrum: Luciano Berio's Sinfonia

[MUSICAL EXAMPLE 8: Luciano Berio, *Sinfonia*, Third Movement: "In ruhig fliessender Bewegung"]

This monument of post-modern music, written in 1968/69 is scored for eight voices and orchestra. The skeletal background is the *Scherzo* on Gustav Mahler's *Second Symphony*. Parts of the overlying movement is for the spoken voice, the text in part from Samuel Beckett's *The Unnamable*. Other statements, some more or less intended to be understood include a repeated "Keep going!" toward the end. The composer has provided the following notes for the movement which he describes as "the most experimental work I have ever written:

The piece is a tribute to Gustav Mahler (whose work seems to carry all the weight of the last two centuries of musical history) and, in particular, to the third movement of his Second Symphony ("Resurrection"). Mahler bears the same relationship to the whole of the music of this part as Beckett does to the text. The result is a kind of "voyage to Cythera" that reaches its climax just before the third movement (the scherzo) of the *Second Symphony*. This movement is treated as a generative source, from which are derived a great number of musical figures ranging from Bach to Schönberg, Brahms to Stravinsky, Berg to Webern, Boulez, Pousseur, myself and others. The various musical characters, constantly integrated in the flow of Mahler's discourse, are combined and transformed as they go.

In this way these familiar objects and faces, set in a new perspective, context and light, unexpectedly take on a new meaning. The combination and unification of musical characters that are foreign to each other is probably the main driving force behind this third part of the *Sinfonia*, a mediation on a Mahlerian "object trouvé." If I were asked to explain the presence of Mahler's scherzo in *Sinfonia*, the image that would naturally spring to mind would be that of a river running through a constantly changing landscape, disappearing from time to time underground, only to emerge later totally transformed. Its course is at times perfectly apparent, at others hard to perceive, sometimes it takes on a totally recognizable form, at others it is made up of a multitude of tiny details lost in the surrounding forest of musical presences.⁴⁶

In this remarkable program note, the composer acknowledges "a meditation" -- a state of mind in which the "constantly changing" flow of mental life ("a river. . .") incorporates the most diverse elements including some as if conscious, others ("disappearing from time to time underground. . .") unconscious. It must be emphasized that the creation of this illusion of ongoing mental life is no spontaneous gesture, rather a meticulously crafted work of art.

(6) Mind to mind: From Composer to Listener

In an imaginary musical Utopia the composer's musical ideas would be transmitted directly to the auditor for comprehension and aesthetic appreciation; and the musical experience uniform and reliable. Reality dictates otherwise as even the manuscript of a musical work may be

but a pale representation of the composer's concept. However, the physical score need not suffice, as the performer may be able to reveal the composer's intent. On the other hand, what the performer brings to the music of his own, by way of interpretation, may lead in a different direction. A further complexity in the transmission of music is that the forms that the composer has created might lend themselves to multiple interpretations revealing latent meanings of which even the composer was unaware.

What is beyond doubt is that the "final common pathway" from the mind of the composer through the realization of performance finds its terminus in the "ear" of the listener. This virtual "ear" is a multi-faceted organ through which are brought to bear many aspects of cognition, experience, memory, training and character. Accordingly, an actual performance -- or even virtual performance, in the perusal of a musical score -- will provide different (and frequently idiosyncratic) musical experiences. At this level, it is the listener who participates in performance and determines the music itself and how it is experienced. The expected participation of the listener in the creation of music has been one of the contributions of musical postmodernism (John Cage, Luciano Berio etc.) However, in this sense listening to music of all eras has always been "postmodern"!

Among the elements the listener brings to the musical experience is a latent awareness of mental process that is properly called preconscious. It is the conveyor, as it were, of images, ideas, affects, memory, fantasy etc; all of which may participate in the individual musical experience. However, the doings of mind itself are readily perceived with a change of focus: that is, the introspective perception of mental process as opposed to mental content. It is precisely to this that the *simulacra* of mental life in music addresses itself.

In the examples considered in this paper a fundamental feature of mentation is encoded in music; indeed, as such, a basic aspect of nature and of human nature. This allows for an entrainment on the part of the listener to diverse and at first unfamiliar musical ideas, and may thus provide an added dimension of meaning and appreciation.

NOTES

- ¹ Richard Ellman, Preface to James Joyce's *Ulysses*, ed. Hans Walter Gabler, New York: Vintage, 1986, p.ix
- ² Jennifer Mundy, *Letters of Desire*, in *Surrealism-desire unbound*, London: Tate Publishing, 2001, p.12
- ³ Idem
- ⁴ F.E. Sparshott, *Aesthetics of Music*, *The New Groves Dictionary of Music and musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie, London: Macmillan, 1980, Vol. I, p. 120
- ⁵ Ibid, p. 121
- ⁶ Eduard Hanslick, *The Beautiful in Music* (original Leipzig 1854), tr. Gustav Cohen, Library of Liberal Arts, New York: Bobbs-Merrill, 1957, p.48
- ⁷ Susanne K. Langer, *Feeling and form*, New York: Scribner, 1953, p.27
- ⁸ Sigmund Freud, *An Autobiographical Study* (1924), Standard Edition, Vol.20, pp. 1-74
- ⁹ *The Stream of Thought*, *The Principle of Psychology* (1891), Chapter IX, *Great Books of the Western World*, ed. Robert Maynard Hutchins, University of Chicago, 1952
- ¹⁰ Ibid, p. 146
- ¹¹ Ibid, p. 147
- ¹² Ibid, p. 176
- ¹³ Ibid, p. 155
- ¹⁴ Ellman, op.cit.
- ¹⁵ Langer, op.cit., p. 28
- ¹⁶ Lean Edel, quoted in Peter M. Axthelm, *The Modern Confessional Novel*, New Haven: Yale, 1967, p.11
- ¹⁷ *The Discovery of the Unconscious* [REF]
- ¹⁸ Don Michael Randel, *The New Harvard Dictionary of Music*, Cambridge: Harvard, 1986, p.49
- ¹⁹ Ibid, pp.764-767
- ²⁰ Christopher D. S. Field, *Fantasia to 17th Century*, *The New Groves Dictionary of Music Online*, accessed March 2003, <http://www.grovemusic.com>>
- ²¹ William Drabkin, *Fantasia-19th and 20th Centuries*, Groves, as above
- ²² *The Musical Quarterly*, Winter 2000, Volume 84, Number 4
- ²³ Ibid, p.581
- ²⁴ for a review of this literature see Stuart Feder, *The Nostalgia of Charles Ives*, *Musical Quarterly*, op.cit, p.655
- ²⁵ Ibid, p.663
- ²⁶ *The Compact Edition of the Oxford English Dictionary*, Volume II, Oxford University Press, 1971, 2827
- ²⁷ *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Current English*, Ninth Edition, Clarendon:Oxford, 1995, p.1294
- ²⁸ See Susan Sontag, *Regarding the Pain of Others*, New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2003, p.26: The truth is that [photographs] are not 'simply' anything, and certainly not regarded just as facts . . . [A] sleight of hand allows photographs to be both objective record and personal testimony, both a faithful copy or transcription of an actual moment of reality and an interpretation of that reality. . ."
- ²⁹ See *Edison's Eve*, Gaby wood, New York: Knopf, 2002
- ³⁰ Jean Baudrillard, *The Map Precedes the Territory*, in *The Truth About Truth-De-confusing and Reconstructing the Postmodern World*, editor Walter Truett Anderson, New York: Penguin Putnam, 1995, pp. 79-81
- ³¹ Arnold Schoenberg, *New Music, Outmoded Music, Style and Idea*, in *Style and Idea-Selected Writings of Arnold Schoenberg*, ed. Leonard Stein, New York: St. Martins Press, 1975, p.120-121
- ³² Idem
- ³³ Theodor Adorno, *On the Social Situation of Music*, in *Essays on Music*. Selected by Richard Leppert, Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002, p.398
- ³⁴ see for example, Stuart Feder, *Charles Ives: "My Father's Song"*, London and New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992; and Gustav Mahler: *The Music of Fratricide*, *International Review of Psychoanalysis*, Volume 8, 1981, pp.257-284 (also articles in same journal, 1978 & 1980)
- ³⁵ Schoenberg, Op.Cit., p. 105
- ³⁶ Theodor Adorno, cited by Susanne Rode-Breyman, in liner notes to *Ewartung*, Sony Classical, SMK 48 466
- ³⁷ Theodor Adorno, *Philosophy of Modern Music*, tr. Anne G. Mitchell and Wesley V. Blomster, New York; Seabury Press, p. 39
- ³⁸ Alexander Carpenter, *Schoenberg's Ewartung and Freudian Case Histories: A Preliminary Investigation*, *Discourses in Music*, Vol. 3, No.2 (winter 2001-2002), at <http://www.discourses.ca/v3n2a1.html>

- ⁴⁰ Sigmund Freud and Josef Breuer, *Studies on Hysteria* (1893-1895) Standard Edition, Vol 2, pp.21-306
- ⁴¹ John J. Church, Opera Insights, <http://www.operaworld.com/special/expectation.shtrnl>
- ⁴² Arnold Schoenberg, *Ewartung*, Pierre Boulez conductor, Janis Martin soprano, Sony CD, AMK 48 466
- ⁴³ Theodor Adorno, *Mahler-A musical Physiognamy*, tr. Edmund Jophcott, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992 (two other features are "suspension" and "fulfillment" -- *Erfüllung*. The term *Durchbruch*, was actually coined by Paul Bekker in Gustav Mahler's *Sinfonien*, Berlin 1921, p.45)
- ⁴⁴ Natalie Bauer-Lechner, *Gustav Mahler in den Erinnerungen von Natalie Bauer-Lechner*an Diary entries, Herbert Killian, ed, Hamburg 1984, quoted in Constantin Floros, *Gustav Mahler -- The Symphonies*, tr. Vernon and Jutta Wicker, Portland: Amadeus Press, 1985, p. 40
- ⁴⁵ Charles Ives, *The Complete Songs*, Vol.III, Albany Records, 1993, "Troy 079"
- ⁴⁶ Luciano Berio, *Liner Notes to Sinfonia*, Erato-Disques, 1986, #2292-45228-2

OLD HOME DAY (1920)

[Charles Ives]

*'Ducite ab urbe domum,
mea carmina, ducite Daphnin'*

- Virgil

Go my songs!

Draw Daphnis from the city.

A minor tune from Todd's opera house,
comes to me as I cross the square, there,

We boys used to shout the songs that rouse
the hearts of the brave and fair,
of the brave and fair.

As we march along down Main street,
behind the village band,

The dear old trees, with their arch of leaves
seem to grasp us by the hand.

While we step along
to the tune of an Irish song,
Glad but wistful sounds the old church bell,
for underneath's a note of sadness,
"Old home town" farewell.

A corner lot, a white picket fence,
daisies almost everywhere, there
We boys used to play "One old cat,"
and base hits filled the air,
filled the summer air.

As we march along on Main street,
of that "Down East" Yankee town,
Comes a sign of life, from the "3rd Corps" fife,
strains of an old breakdown;
While we step along to the tune of its Irish song;
Comes another sound we all know well,
It takes us way back forty years, that
little red school house bell.